Session II: Supporting Students’ Learning Renewal and Academic Success: Rethinking Developmental Education

Dr. Beth Ingram
Executive Vice President and Provost
Northern Illinois University

Dr. Meera Komarraju
Provost and Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Dr. Colleen Sexton
Interim Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs
Governors State University
A Brief Overview

• **Learning Renewal** – Strategies to address the disparate impact of the pandemic on students who have had fewer opportunities to learn and severe challenges to their wellbeing despite the heroic efforts of educators across the P-20 system.

• **Developmental Education** – Courses, typically not for credit, that are “designed to develop the reading, writing, or math skills of students who are deemed – usually through standardized tests – underprepared for college-level courses.”

• **Developmental Education Reform** – Efforts to improve student outcomes, including time to and cost of degree, by changing:
  - How student learning is assessed for placement
  - The types of supports for student academic success
  - Pathways for different groups of majors (e.g. STEM and non-STEM)
  - Other wraparound supports and institutional practices

Differences in Rates of Developmental Education Placement
African-American first-year students placed in developmental education at higher rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All Public Universities</th>
<th>Community Colleges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% Placed in Developmental Ed:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>14.6%</td>
<td>65.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data source: IBHE IHEIS 2018 Fall Enrollment Collection

Data source: ICCB Centralized Data System, Fall Semester 2016 - 2017

Source: IBHE Equity Presentation (August 2020)
And when placed in developmental ed, African-Americans accumulate fewer credit hours.
Latinx first-year students placed in developmental education at higher rates

% Placed in Developmental Ed: All Public Universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Latinx</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

% Placed in Developmental Ed: Community Colleges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Latinx</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>57.7%</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data source: IBHE IHEIS 2018 Fall Enrollment Collection

Data source: ICCB Centralized Data System, Fall Semester 2016 - 2017

Source: IBHE Equity Presentation (August 2020)
And when placed developmental ed, Latinx accumulate fewer credit hours than White peers

First Semester Credit Hour Accumulation by First-Time/Full-Time Students at Illinois Public Universities

Source: IBHE Equity Presentation (August 2020)
Once enrolled, low-income students are significantly more likely to be placed in development education.

Data source: IHEIS Enrollment Collection Fall of AY2018-19 & ICCB Centralized Data System 2014, 2015, and 2016 Tracking Cohorts

Source: IBHE Equity Presentation (September 2020)
Differences in Outcomes in Gateway Courses by Subject and Developmental Education Model
Flow from Entry into Traditional English/Language Arts Dev. Ed. to Passing a Gateway Course at Illinois Public Universities (N=745)

Source: ICCB/IBHE SJR 41 Report (December 2020)
Flow from Entry into Traditional Mathematics Dev. Ed. to Passing a Gateway Course at Illinois Public Universities (N=1,968)

- Entering Dev. Ed.: 100.0%
- Completing Dev. Ed.: 63.1%
- Enrolling in Gateway: 46.1%
- Passing Gateway: 32.6%

Source: ICCB/IBHE SJR 41 Report (December 2020)
Flow from Entry into Co-Requisite Mathematics to Passing a Gateway Course at Illinois Public Universities (N=270)

- Entering Co-Req.: 100.0%
- Completing Co-Req.: 76.3%
- Enrolling in Gateway: 92.2%
- Passing Gateway: 71.1%

Source: ICCB/IBHE SJR 41 Report (December 2020)
Illinois Efforts to Support Learning Renewal and Rethink Developmental Education

• High School to College and Career Transitions
  o Transitional Math and English Courses – 12th grade courses to help students stay on track; passing grade allows for immediate placement into credit-bearing courses at community colleges
  o Math Pathways – math sequences for specific career fields
  o Competency-Based Education Pilot in School Districts – focus on needed learning and personalized progression, not “seat-time”
  o Policies: Illinois Postsecondary Workforce Readiness Act (Public Act 9-674)

• Governor’s Emergency Education Relief (GEER) Funds - resources to support higher education student enrollment, retention, and completion, with a focus on those who have been most impacted by the pandemic including students historically underrepresented and underserved

• Illinois P-20 Council Learning Renewal Resource Guide
Illinois Efforts to Support Learning Renewal and Rethink Developmental Education, continued

• Scaling Developmental Education Reform
  o Placement – multiple measures and approaches for placement to acknowledge and build on what students know
  o Bridge Programs – supports for students to develop key skills through summer or other short-term programs
  o More Models of Developmental Education – co-requisite, studio, and other models that place students in credit-bearing courses with additional supports
  o Additional wraparound supports
Supporting Students’ Learning Renewal and Academic Success: Rethinking Developmental Education

Dr. Colleen Sexton
*Interim Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs*
Governors State University
Supporting Students’ Learning Renewal and Academic Success: Rethinking Developmental Education

Presentation to the Illinois Board of Higher Education (IBHE) Board of Trustees Leadership Conference

Governors State University
Colleen M. Sexton, Ph.D.
Associate Provost/Associate VP Academic Affairs
csextton@govst.edu
October 13, 2021
First Year Experience Like No Other

What did we choose to address?

Committed to...

- Learning Communities
- Connections
- Support

- Students enrolled...
  - Full-time
  - Day-time
  - Credit Bearing Courses
  - Size limits

- Full-time Faculty teaching
  - Freshman Classes
Two-years planning our Transformation and Continuous Assessment of Data

General Education Task Force

- Cooperative effort of faculty and administrators created by the Faculty Senate
- Reviewed national research, attended conferences and based the program on best-practices
- Incorporated best practices based on research (LEAP, CCA)
- Today – General Education Council led by Director and Asst. Director – both Faculty

Lower Division Steering Committee

- Cross-functional and cross-divisional
- Includes academic, student affairs, admissions, housing and marketing leadership
- Includes faculty and general education leaders
- Charged to propose creation and revision of policy
- Innovative strategies about tightly integrated curricular and co-curricular activities and support

How did GSU identify this as an issue?
Average Age of Direct-entry First Year Students = 19.2 years old

Average age of Transfer students = 27.2 years old
## Guided Pathways

**What Strategies were Developed?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Smart Start</th>
<th>Peer Mentors</th>
<th>Early Warnings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Two weeks before semester starts, build abilities in Math and/or English</td>
<td>Offered through Center for Junior Year and Academic Resource Center</td>
<td>GSU Star Midterm Grades Save My Semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplemental support throughout the term</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GSU Star
Midterm Grades
Save My Semester
• Admitted students’ options prior to the start of Smart Start:
  • Given access to online mathematics placement instrument (ALEKS) to engage in improving mathematical conceptual knowledge and skills
  • Invited to participate in campus events and activities
  • Used instead of remediation courses
  • All students invited to participate
  • Required for those who did not meet minimum admissions guidelines
  • Began two weeks before classes
  • Designed to build confidence and address common issues found in mathematics and writing courses
  • Sustained through supplemental instruction sections throughout the semester
Meta-major Approach

Moved from themed cohorts to Focus Areas

- Civic Engagement
- Global Citizenship
- Sustainability

- Education
- Business
- Arts and Entertainment
- Humanities
- Social & Behavioral Sciences
- STEM
- Discovery

- Students in Smart Start English and those in Smart Start Math – first semester GPAs consistently ranged between 2.5 – 2.7; number of credit hours earned first semester 12
- Students enrolled in both Smart Start Math and English – first semester GPAs 1.8 – 2.0; number of credit hours earned first semester 10-11
What are our Next Steps?

Equity in Top Enrolling Courses

Top Enrolling First-year Fall 2018 Classes
Ranked by Size (Desc) with the % who earned A/B/C

- Elementary Statistics (MATH-2100)
- Interdisc. Humanities (FYS-1001)
- Writing Studies I (ENGL-1000)
- Public Discourse (COMS-1160)
- Mastering College (COUN-1008)
- U.S. History I (HIST-1110)
- Cultural Anthropology (ANTH-1100)
- College Algebra (MATH-1423)

What are our Next Steps?
Spring 2021 – Piloted Mathematics co-requisite model

- Provides support for students in Elementary Statistics.
- This 2-hours per week math laboratory blends an emporium model of individualized, self-guided algebra review (supported by the instructor) with activity-based instruction to help students apply algebraic and statistical skills to solve “real world” problems, and discussions to help students develop self-efficacy, good study habits, and positive habits of the mind. Problem-based activities should emphasize reading and writing of mathematics.
- Placement in course based on ALEKS Placement Assessment score. Students with an ALEKS score of 46 or higher are exempt from co-requisite course.
- Formal review of performance data ongoing.
Fall 2021 – Piloting Writing Studies I & II co-requisite model

• To increase retention, the first-year writing program proposed moving to an accelerated learning program model where students in need of remediation will take a 3 credit hour Writing I or Writing II course paired with an additional 1 credit hour component, taught by the same faculty member, designed to provide intensive support for students and their writing.

• ENGL-1090 Academic Writing Workshop - Focuses on building students' commitment to writing processes associated with drafting, circulating, and revising writing.
Fall 2021 – Piloted Writing Studies I & II co-requisite model

Students are exempt from the co-requisite Writing Workshop course if they meet any of the following conditions:

- GPA of 3.40 on a 4.0 scale or acceptance into GSU’s honor’s program at the honor’s program director’s discretion.
- Demonstrated achievement in high school English classes by receiving an A in all four years.
- A grade of A in a college-level writing course or writing-intensive course.
- A portfolio of prior work that demonstrates evidence of proficiency.

Formal review of performance data begins end of FA21.
Supporting Students’ Learning Renewal and Academic Success: Rethinking Developmental Education

Dr. Beth Ingram
Executive Vice President and Provost
Northern Illinois University
Prior to Fall 2021

- Courses did not earn college credit towards a degree
- Mathematics
  - MATH 108, MATH 109
- English
  - ENGL 102
- Literacy Skills
  - LTRE 100
Guiding Principles

• Use a collaborate and data-informed approach
• Use multiple measures to assess readiness and placement
• Ensure equitable access to college level courses
• Implement comprehensive and integrated support programs for students
• Offer instructional support for faculty
• Assess and improve
Process for reform

Collaborative, inclusive, student-centric

- Process led by Vice Provost for Academic Affairs
- Included Associate Deans, Chairs and Faculty from relevant departments
- Placement and approach vetted widely
Mathematics

- Implemented ALEKS placement exam
  - Provides tutorials for skill review
  - Allows benchmarking for placement
- ILEA grant to support supplemental instruction and tutoring
- Continual refinement of placement cutoffs
- Exploring math pathways based on expected major
• Eliminated LTRE 102
• No placement exam or standardized test score
• Created context-specific learning courses
  – Humanities, natural sciences, social sciences, general studies
  – All courses bear college credit
• Open to all students
  – Students with HSGPA<3.0 strongly urged to enroll
Eliminated ENGL 102
Requires no placement exam or standardized test score for placement
Course placement based on high school GPA
  – All courses bear college credit
  – Students can take exam to place in a different course
Concurrent initiatives

• Partnership with ACUE (Association of College and University Educators) for faculty development
• Accreditation quality improvement project
• Expanded use of technology to connect students to support services (advising, tutoring, writing center and more)
• Attention to non-academic needs of students
Thank you!
Supporting Students’ Learning Renewal and Academic Success: Rethinking Developmental Education

Dr. Meera Komarraju
Provost and Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs
Southern Illinois University Carbondale
Supporting Students’ Learning Renewal and Academic Success: Rethinking Developmental Education

Meera Komaraju
Provost and Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs
Achieving IBHE’s Strategic Plan, *A Thriving Illinois*, and its 3 goals:

- **Equity**: Close the equity gaps for students who have historically been left behind
- **Sustainability**: Build a stronger financial future for individuals and institutions
- **Growth**: Increase talent and innovation to drive economic growth

- Every college student must take a Math course
- Typically, at SIU-C, STEM & Business majors take Math 108-109-111-139-140-150 courses
- Others take Math 101
- **Equity Implications**: Less prepared students may not successfully pursue STEM and BUSINESS careers and get left behind
Math 108 improved through continuous improvement. Initiating rigorous placement (2017) and an Early Warning Intervention Program (EWIP in 2014). Moved away from 3 traditional lectures; added labs; tried various approaches and kept tweaking and improving

MATH 108 SP00-SP16; achieving a “C” or better grade
Prerequisite course

• Intermediate Algebra for College Algebra
• Timing is critical: prior semester is more effective
• An A/B grade greatly increases likelihood of success
• “C” grade almost as unhelpful as D, F, W grades
• Completing material in HS is linked to greater success
Placement Test in College

• Students take a Placement Test and placed in College Algebra [Math 108] or Calculus 1 [Math 150]

• Placement Test, three levels and three trials each; completed online, unproctored. An additional in-class placement test is given the first day of class

• What happens to students who are not placed in College Algebra?

• Placed in College Algebra Enhanced [Math106]

• If students don't place into Math 106 (they can complete a free online prep program (13 shorter tests; 10 hours) and then placed in Math 106
Fall 2015

Math 108  
(College Algebra)

• Higher placement score
• Traditional lecture-based
• 2 lecture + 2 labs
• Same common final

Math 106 (counts as Math 108)  
(College Algebra Enhanced)

• Lower placement score
• More worksheets
• 3 lecture + 2 labs
• [all lectures 30 mins+ 20 mins activity]
• Same common final
Co-Remediation - Math 106 - is successful!

- Fall 2017:
  - **Math 108**
  - **Math 106**
  - **College Algebra**
  - **College Algebra Enhanced**
  - 61.8% (ABC grades)
  - 54.5% (ABC grades)
  - Math 106 students performed almost as well as Math 108 students
  - (Even though they started with lower placement scores)
What is the “magic” in Co-Remediation?

1. Rigorous implementation of Placement Test [online and in-class]
2. Early Warning Intervention Program feedback (week 4 and 8) (Fall 2014); Orange & yellow categories do well and red tend to struggle
3. Pedagogy:
   1. Meeting an extra 50-minutes
   2. Completing worksheets in-class in addition to homework
   3. Getting the “correct” worksheet answer immediately along with the explanation; learning is reinforced
   4. Asking questions one-on-one while completing the worksheets
   5. Working in small groups with “similar others” on the worksheets and feeling comfortable to think through, ask questions, and discuss potential solutions to math problems
   6. Cannot “hide”
Next Steps? Extending College Algebra Success to Calculus

Inspired by the success of Math 106, initiated a co-remediation for calculus I (Math 151) in spring 2017. This also has been successful so far!

**Math 150 (current)**
- Higher placement score
- traditional lecture-based
- 4 lectures
- Same common final

**Math 151 (enhanced)**
- Lower placement score
- More worksheets
- 4 lectures + 1 lab
- Same common final
Thanks to
Wesley Calvert, Thara Lowndes
Patrick Soulz, Mary Wright,
Greg Budzban, Bhaskar Bhattacharya
School of Mathematical & Statistical Sciences

Q&A